

DIVIDED LOYALTIES & BETRAYAL

Sections 7-9: Malignant Faction | Lawrence Growden's Daughter | Treason of the Deepest Dye

CENTRAL QUESTION When political loyalties collide with family, property, military honor, and personal ambition, who decides what counts as duty - and what counts as betrayal?

DIVIDED LOYALTIES TIMELINE

SEP 1777	British occupy Philadelphia	OCT 1777	Arnold wounded at Saratoga
WINTER	Valley Forge; leadership crisis	FEB 1778	France signs American alliance
JUN 1778	British leave; Galloway family divides	1778-79	Grace fights confiscation
APR 1779	Arnold marries Peggy Shippen	SEP 1780	West Point conspiracy exposed

The Revolution Turns Inward

Part 2 followed Americans as they chose sides. Part 3 examines what happened after those choices hardened: Patriot leaders attacked one another, Loyalist families lost homes and inheritances, and one of Washington's finest generals secretly negotiated with the enemy.

- **Political division:** The Patriot cause contained rivalries, accusations, and a serious challenge to Washington's authority.
- **Family division:** Grace Galloway paid for her husband's Loyalism while trying to preserve her daughter's inheritance.
- **Military betrayal:** Benedict Arnold moved from celebrated battlefield hero to conspirator against West Point.

READING LENS The most revealing question is not simply who switched sides, but whose loyalty was recognized, whose was punished, and who controlled the definition of treason.

Three Movements in Part 3

- **Section 7:** Valley Forge exposes military hardship and factional struggles inside the revolutionary leadership.
- **Section 8:** Grace Galloway's diary reveals how confiscation, marriage, and separation reshaped a Loyalist woman's life.
- **Section 9:** Arnold's secret dealings, Peggy Shippen's connections, and John André's capture produce the war's best-known betrayal.

MALIGNANT FACTION

Washington confronts hunger, military criticism, rival commanders, and doubts about his leadership.

TITLE IDEA Washington complained that a “malignant faction” was working against him while his army endured the winter at Valley Forge.

Philadelphia Falls; the Army Waits

British forces occupied Philadelphia in September 1777. Washington’s Continental Army entered winter quarters at Valley Forge on December 19, close enough to monitor the occupied capital but desperately short of dependable food, clothing, and supplies.

- **Military pressure:** Losing the revolutionary capital encouraged doubts about Washington’s effectiveness.
- **Human hardship:** Soldiers confronted disease, inadequate clothing, uncertain rations, and fragile morale.
- **Political pressure:** An army fighting for independence still depended on Congress and state governments for support.

The Faction Against Washington

Washington believed rivals were using military setbacks to weaken his position. The cluster later called the Conway Cabal included figures associated with Horatio Gates, Thomas Mifflin, and Thomas Conway. Gates’s association with victory at Saratoga made him an obvious alternative in the eyes of Washington’s critics.

- **What Washington feared:** Personal ambition and coordinated criticism might fracture the chain of command.
- **What critics could argue:** A struggling war effort justified scrutiny of the commander in chief.
- **Why the distinction matters:** Disagreement over leadership was not automatically treason, even when Washington experienced it as disloyalty.

DISCUSSION STARTER When does legitimate criticism of a wartime leader become a dangerous attack on the cause itself?

MALIGNANT FACTION

Saratoga, foreign diplomacy, and stronger leadership change the balance of the war.

Saratoga Creates Heroes - and Rivals

The American victory at Saratoga in October 1777 changed the war. General Horatio Gates received broad public credit, while Benedict Arnold had helped drive the fighting and suffered another severe leg wound. The unequal distribution of recognition intensified Arnold's sense that others benefited from his sacrifices.

- **For Washington:** Gates's prominence sharpened comparisons between their military records.
- **For Arnold:** Wounds, disputed recognition, and rank became part of a growing grievance.
- **For the Revolution:** The victory convinced foreign observers that the American cause could survive.

Franklin Helps Secure France

Benjamin Franklin's diplomacy and the Saratoga victory helped secure a formal French alliance on February 6, 1778. French recognition, financing, supplies, and later military assistance transformed a colonial rebellion into a wider international war.

Valley Forge Becomes a Turning Point

Washington retained command by cultivating congressional support, improving administration, and maintaining the loyalty of key officers. Baron von Steuben trained soldiers in consistent drills, while Nathanael Greene strengthened the army's supply system.

- **Leadership lesson:** Washington's endurance mattered as much as an immediate battlefield victory.
- **Political lesson:** The Revolution required cooperation among personalities who did not always trust one another.
- **Strategic lesson:** French intervention forced Britain to reconsider priorities and eventually withdraw from Philadelphia.

BOOK CLUB TAKEAWAY "Malignant faction" describes a civil conflict inside the Patriot leadership, not merely the familiar conflict between Patriots and Loyalists.

Ask While Reading

- Does Brands present Washington's rivals as genuine plotters, legitimate critics, or casualties of wartime political pressure?

LAWRENCE GROWDEN'S DAUGHTER

Grace Galloway fights for her inheritance, her family's future, and her identity as a Loyalist woman.

TITLE IDEA Grace defined herself through her birth family as well as her marriage, insisting that revolutionary officials could not erase her dignity or her inherited identity.

A Family Caught Between Governments

Grace Growden Galloway belonged to a prosperous Pennsylvania family and married Joseph Galloway, a prominent politician who opposed independence. When British forces evacuated Philadelphia in June 1778, Joseph left with their daughter Elizabeth, also called Betsy. Grace stayed behind to defend family property.

- **Joseph's calculation:** Remaining with the British protected him from prosecution by revolutionary authorities.
- **Grace's calculation:** Staying offered the best available chance to preserve the family's house and inheritance.
- **Betsy's loss:** Political allegiance separated daughter and mother as well as husband and wife.

The Trap of Married Women's Property

Under the legal doctrine known as coverture, a married woman's independent legal identity and control over property were often subordinated to her husband. Assets Grace regarded as her family inheritance could therefore be treated as Joseph's property and seized because of his Loyalist allegiance.

- **The legal contradiction:** Grace could be denied independent ownership while still suffering punishment for a husband's politics.
- **The political contradiction:** A revolution defending liberty also used confiscation and collective consequences against opponents.
- **The human consequence:** Protecting a daughter's inheritance required dealing with authorities whose legitimacy Grace resisted.

KEY TERM Coverture was a legal framework that constrained a married woman's separate legal standing and control of property.

LAWRENCE GROWDEN'S DAUGHTER

Confiscation, forced removal, and a remarkable diary reveal the Revolution's civilian cost.

Grace Refuses to Leave Quietly

Pennsylvania officials moved against Loyalist property after the British withdrawal. Grace resisted efforts to dispossess her, sought legal advice, asserted claims to inherited assets, and refused to surrender her Philadelphia residence voluntarily. Officials ultimately removed her by force.

- **From the state's perspective:** Confiscation punished allegiance to an enemy and denied resources to the opposing cause.
- **From Grace's perspective:** Officials treated her family's inheritance as a political prize and punished her for decisions made by her husband.
- **From a modern perspective:** The episode raises questions about due process, property rights, gender, and collective punishment.

What Her Diary Preserves

Grace's diary records financial anxiety, separation from Betsy, conflicts with revolutionary authorities, frustration with Joseph, and her determination not to be socially or personally erased. It gives the Loyalist experience a voice beyond military leaders.

Loyalty Is Not One Simple Thing

- **Loyalty to the Crown:** Grace remained tied to the political world her husband defended.
- **Loyalty to her daughter:** Preserving Betsy's future could matter more than defending an abstract constitutional principle.
- **Loyalty to her birth family:** Her inherited name and property represented continuity that revolutionary confiscation threatened.
- **Loyalty to herself:** Her refusal to disappear quietly expressed personal agency within a restrictive legal system.

BOOK CLUB TAKEAWAY Grace's story makes the Revolution's civil-war dimension visible inside a household, a courtroom, and a struggle over who had the right to own a home.

Ask While Reading

- Was Grace punished for her own convictions, for Joseph's allegiance, for her refusal to submit, or for all three?
- Does her diary change the way the book defines liberty and legitimate authority?

TREASON OF THE DEEPEST DYE

Benedict Arnold's military heroism, injured pride, and secret negotiations collide at West Point.

TITLE IDEA Alexander Hamilton used the phrase “a treason of the deepest dye” in a September 25, 1780, letter describing Arnold's attempt to surrender West Point.

Before the Betrayal: A Genuine Hero

Arnold was not a lifelong Loyalist waiting to reveal himself. He helped capture Fort Ticonderoga, served in the difficult campaign against Quebec, delayed British movement on Lake Champlain, and played an important role at Saratoga, where he was badly wounded in October 1777.

- **Courage:** Arnold repeatedly exposed himself to danger in the American cause.
- **Sacrifice:** Military service brought serious wounds and financial strain.
- **Resentment:** Disputes over rank, recognition, expenses, and reputation deepened his anger.

HISTORICAL IRONY Had Arnold died at Saratoga, he might be remembered as one of the Revolution's most celebrated heroes.

Philadelphia Changes the Story

Washington appointed the recovering Arnold to command Philadelphia after the British evacuation in June 1778. There he encountered Loyalist social circles, clashed with Pennsylvania political leaders, faced accusations involving official conduct, and became increasingly convinced that his sacrifices were unappreciated.

Peggy Shippen and British Contacts

Arnold married Peggy Shippen in April 1779. Peggy moved in Philadelphia circles that had known British officers during the occupation, including Major John André. Her connections helped create a channel to British intelligence, although historians disagree about precisely how much initiative and responsibility she should be assigned.

- **Evidence exists:** A surviving coded communication contains writing associated with both Arnold and Peggy.
- **Interpretation remains debated:** Describing Peggy as the sole mastermind oversimplifies the historical record.

TREASON OF THE DEEPEST DYE

A captured British officer exposes a conspiracy that could have transformed the war.

Why West Point Mattered

West Point guarded a strategic section of the Hudson River. British control could have disrupted communication and movement between New England and the other states. Arnold obtained command and secretly negotiated to turn the American stronghold over to the British.

- **The American expectation:** A trusted general would strengthen the position and protect the Hudson corridor.
- **The secret reality:** Arnold shared sensitive information while discussing compensation and cooperation with the enemy.
- **The larger danger:** Losing West Point would have damaged military security and confidence in the Patriot leadership.

André Is Captured

On September 23, 1780, New York militiamen stopped Major John André as he returned toward British lines. Documents linked to West Point exposed the conspiracy. Arnold escaped to British protection, while André was convicted as a spy and executed on October 2.

Hamilton Sees a Double Tragedy

Hamilton's letter to his fiancée, Elizabeth Schuyler, described both the danger of Arnold's betrayal and Peggy's apparent distress after her husband fled. At the time, Hamilton believed Peggy had not known about the plot; surviving evidence and later research complicate that immediate judgment.

- **For Washington:** The conspiracy exposed betrayal by a gifted officer whom he had repeatedly supported.
- **For Arnold:** A British commission offered reward and protection but could not restore his American reputation.
- **For André:** Duty to Britain ended in capture and execution as an intelligence operative.
- **For Peggy:** Marriage, appearance, gender expectations, and evidence all shape competing interpretations of her role.

BOOK CLUB TAKEAWAY Arnold's story raises a distinction between changing political allegiance openly and secretly violating a military trust while responsible for other people's lives.

Ask While Reading

- Can Arnold's grievances explain his decision without excusing his willingness to surrender West Point?

SYNTHESIS & DISCUSSION

Political rivalry, confiscation, gender, family loyalty, and military betrayal overlap throughout the war.

THREE FACES OF DIVIDED LOYALTY

Figure	What was at stake?	How loyalty was tested
Washington	Command, army, and national survival.	Rival officers challenged his leadership.
Grace Galloway	Home, inheritance, daughter, and dignity.	Marriage linked her property to Loyalist treason.
Benedict Arnold	Honor, rank, money, reputation, and command.	He secretly offered West Point to the British.
Peggy Shippen	Marriage, family ties, and personal safety.	Her British contacts intersected with espionage.
John André	Military duty, intelligence, and his life.	Capture exposed the plot and led to execution.

Five Themes to Carry Forward

- **Faction:** People fighting on the same side still competed over authority, recognition, and strategy.
- **Property:** Confiscation turned political allegiance into a struggle over homes, inheritance, and survival.
- **Gender:** Marriage law shaped what Grace could own and how observers judged Peggy's responsibility.
- **Reputation:** Military glory could become resentment, while social standing could disappear with a government's change.
- **Betrayal:** The word describes sharply different acts depending on the obligation and perspective involved.

Questions That Connect the Stories

- **Washington:** When does disagreement within a movement threaten the movement itself?
- **Grace:** Can a revolution dedicated to liberty justify punishing a woman for her husband's politics?
- **Arnold:** When do personal grievances become an unforgivable violation of public trust?

CORE INTERPRETATION The Revolution was a civil war not only because Americans fought on different sides, but because family relationships, property rights, political institutions, and military loyalties fractured from within.

DISCUSSION & SOURCES

Eight discussion questions, a one-minute spoken summary, and the principal historical references.

Best Discussion Questions

1. Was Washington's "malignant faction" a genuine conspiracy or the kind of leadership criticism a struggling war required?
2. Why did victory at Saratoga strengthen the Revolution while also deepening rivalries among its military leaders?
3. Should Grace Galloway have been held responsible for Joseph Galloway's Loyalism?
4. How does coverture change the familiar claim that the American Revolution was fought for liberty?
5. Which loyalty mattered most to Grace: her husband, her daughter, her inheritance, the Crown, or her own identity?
6. Do Arnold's wounds, financial losses, and resentment help explain his betrayal, or do they make it harder to excuse?
7. How should Peggy Shippen's role be judged when contemporary impressions and later evidence point in different directions?
8. Which story best demonstrates Brands's claim that the Revolution was America's first civil war: Washington's faction, Grace's dispossession, or Arnold's treason?

One-Minute Spoken Summary

SUMMARY Part 3 shows the Revolution turning inward. At Valley Forge, Washington confronted shortages and a "malignant faction" that questioned his leadership, even as Saratoga and Franklin's diplomacy helped secure the French alliance. In Philadelphia, Grace Galloway stayed behind when her Loyalist husband and daughter left, only to discover that marriage law and confiscation threatened property she considered her inheritance. Her diary reveals a woman struggling for dignity, family, and ownership. Meanwhile, Benedict Arnold moved from wounded hero to embittered commander. His marriage to Peggy Shippen connected him to British contacts, and Major John André's capture exposed the plan to surrender West Point. Together these stories show that loyalty, liberty, and betrayal were contested inside armies, households, and the new revolutionary government itself.

Source & Copyright Note

This reading companion is an original interpretive summary and does not reproduce the book's text. Events are grouped thematically; precise section boundaries may vary by edition. Principal references: H. W. Brands, *Our First Civil War*; George Washington's Mount Vernon, Valley Forge, Benedict Arnold, West Point, and John André; National Park Service, Saratoga campaign and Benedict Arnold; U.S. Department of State, the 1778 French alliance; American Battlefield Trust, Grace Growden Galloway and Alexander Hamilton's September 25, 1780, letter; Smith College, Grace Galloway's diary and property confiscation; and *Journal of the American Revolution*, review of *Our First Civil War*.